

Presented: 2014 Conference on State and Federal Appeals June 5-6, 2014 Austin, TX

## Interview with Former Chief Justice Wallace B. Jefferson

Hon. Wallace B. Jefferson Pamela Stanton Baron

## Paper: Ten Things Your Client Needs to Know About Taking a Case to the Texas Supreme Court

Pamela Stanton Baron © 2014 Pamela Stanton Baron

> Pamela Stanton Baron Attorney at Law Post Office Box 5573 Austin, Texas 78763 psbaron@baroncounsel.com 512-479-8480



# **Ten Things Your Client Needs to Know About Taking a Case to the Texas Supreme Court**

### By Pamela Stanton Baron

#### TABLE OF CONTENTS

		Page
1.	The odds are against you: understand the stages of review and the odds at each stage	1
2.	Some animals are more equal than others: the odds are not the same for all cases	3
3.	They will get to it when they get to it: it is a long process (but getting shorter)	4
4.	It's gonna cost you: it is an expensive process	5
5.	No news is good news/no news is bad news; non-action by the Court sends a signal	5
6.	Put an offer on the table: consider settlement at each stage	8
7.	It's not about you: the Court takes a broader view of the issues and the role of the courts	9
8.	You've got to have friends: amicus support is vital	9
9.	You are not driving the bus: the Court may take a very different direction when it writes the opinion; a winning petitioner may need to seriously consider a narrow rehearing motion	10
10.	As your appellate attorney bound by the Standards for Appellate Conduct, I will not oppose routine motions or attack the other side or the Court; these actions are barred by the Standards and are a waste of your money and my time and	
	reputation	11
Appe	endix A: Texas Supreme Court Statistics, 1980-2013	12

## Ten Things Your Client Needs to Know About Taking a Case to the Texas Supreme Court

#### By Pamela Stanton Baron

Most clients contemplating an appeal to the Texas Supreme Court want to know the answer to three questions: what are my chances of success, how long will it take, and how much will it cost? The simple answer is 9%, 2 years, and \$50,000 or more. Of course, the real answer is more complicated. And, the client needs to know far more than the answer to these three questions.

This paper identifies ten things clients need to know about taking a case to the Texas Supreme Court. A client who is educated about the process can make better strategic decisions and will have realistic expectations about the end result.

#### 1. The odds are against you: understand the stages of review and the odds at each stage.

A case at the Texas Supreme Court proceeds in four stages: (1) the petition-filing stage; (2) the response stage; (3) briefs on the merits; and (4) grant and opinion.

The author has undertaken several studies over the years to determine odds of a grant at the first three stages. The studies generally show that responses are filed, either voluntarily or at the request of the Court, in about 50% of the cases; briefs on the merits are requested in about 25% of the cases; and the petition is granted in about 10% of the cases. At each stage, the odds of a grant increase.

The chart below summarizes three studies:

Stages of a case\*

	2009 %	2010 %	2012 %
Voluntary response	10.5	8.3	14.0
Response requested	39.0	33.3	41.3
Total responses	49.5	41.6	55.3
Full briefing	20.5	20.0	29.3
Grant or PC	11.0	7.7	10.0
Deny or dismiss	89.0	92.3	90.0
Still pending	0.0	0.0	0.0
Total	100%	100%	100%

<sup>\*</sup> Studies look at 200-300 consecutive cases in which petitions for review, mandamus, or habeas were actually filed and exclude disciplinary appeals.

Based on these studies, it is possible to calculate the odds of a grant at each stage of a case, as shown in the chart on the following page:

#### Odds of a Grant by Stage

	2009 study	2010 study	2012 study	Average
Petition stage	11%	7.7%	10.0%	9.6%
Petition after response	22%	18.5%	18.1%	19.5%
Petition after briefs	54%	38.5%	34.1%	42.2%

And, then, of course, the odds of a grant generally increase the longer the case is pending:

Shadow Docket (Petitions Pending More Than a Year Without Action) Grant Rates

Shadow dkt.	Cases	PC	Grant	Grant
July 31	Pend.			Rate %
2009	43	17	11	65
2010	45	16	4	44
2011	43	13	2	35
2012	44	11	11	50
3-Term				
Average:				49%

Success rate, of course, is different from the grant rate. The following chart shows the percentage of granted cases in which the Court reversed the lower court's judgment in whole or in part. The average for the past five years is about an 89% reversal rate in granted cases.

#### Reversal Rates

Term ended Aug. 31	Deciding	Rev'd (%)
	opinions	
2009	114	93
2010	93	92
2011	112	86
2012	94	89
2013	84	86
Average		89%

So, to calculate the overall odds of success at the various stages, the odds of a grant would be multiplied by the reversal rate:

#### Success Rates

	Odds of grant	Reversal rate	Odds of success
Petition stage	9.6%	89%	8.5%
Petition after response	19.5%	89%	17.4%
Petition after briefs	42.2%	89%	37.6%
Shadow docket	49%	89%	43.6%





Find the full text of this and thousands of other resources from leading experts in dozens of legal practice areas in the <u>UT Law CLE eLibrary (utcle.org/elibrary)</u>

Title search: Ten Things Your Client Needs to Know About Taking a Case to the Texas Supreme Court

Also available as part of the eCourse

<u>Texas Supreme Court Update and Justice Panel, plus Interview with Former Chief</u>

<u>Justice Wallace B. Jefferson</u>

First appeared as part of the conference materials for the  $24^{\rm th}$  Annual Conference on State and Federal Appeals session "Interview with Former Chief Justice Wallace B. Jefferson"