

Cathlynn Cannon
November 12, 2015

Determining an Insurer's Duty to Indemnify Before Settlement or Judgment

UT LAW CLE

1

© 2015 Wilson Elser. All rights reserved.



Is the Duty to Indemnify Ripe Before the Lawsuit Ends?

Never

- *Firemen's Ins. Co. v. Burch*,
442 S.W.2d 331 (Tex. 1968).

Sometimes

- *Farmers Tex. Ins. Exch. v. Griffin*,
856 S.W.2d 81 (Tex. 1997).

2

© 2015 Wilson Elser. All rights reserved.



PRE-GRIFFIN

- The duty to defend and duty to indemnify are separate and distinct.
- The duty to defend is broader than the duty to indemnify.
- If there is no duty to defend, then there can be no duty to indemnify.

3

© 2015 Wilson Elser. All rights reserved.



Am. Physicians Ins. Exch. V. Garcia

We start with the proposition that an insurer has no duty to settle a claim that is not covered under its policy. See *generally Western Heritage Ins. Co. v. River Entertainment*, 998 F.2d 311, 312 (5th Cir.1993) (holding that if no duty to defend is invoked by the pleadings, “the possibility of future indemnity under the terms of the policy is foreclosed”).

Am. Physicians Ins. Exch. v. Garcia, 876 S.W.2d 842, 848 (Tex. 1994)

4

© 2015 Wilson Elser. All rights reserved.



Griffin v. State Farm

[S]uddenly and without warning a vehicle driven by [insured] approached [plaintiff]. Several rounds of gunfire were discharged from [insured's] vehicle in the direction of the Plaintiff. ... This drive-by shooting was a random act of violence which has permanently injured and scarred the plaintiff.

5

© 2015 Wilson Elser. All rights reserved.



Griffin v. State Farm

No facts can be developed in the underlying tort suit that can transform a drive-by shooting into an “auto accident.”

6

© 2015 Wilson Elser. All rights reserved.



Find the full text of this and thousands of other resources from leading experts in dozens of legal practice areas in the [UT Law CLE eLibrary \(utcle.org/elibrary\)](http://utcle.org/elibrary)

Title search: Determining an Insurer's Duty to Indemnify Before Settlement or Judgment

Also available as part of the eCourse

[Coverage and Indemnification Tips and Tricks](#)

First appeared as part of the conference materials for the
20th Annual Insurance Law Institute session

"Insurer Duty to Idemnify: Before Judgment or Settlement?"